



MINUTES OF THE CLEAN SKY 2 JOINT UNDERTAKING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING

21st October 2016, 09:00 – 12:45, White Atrium, Brussels

Agenda

Pre-Board Technical Review (09.00-09.45)		
1	CS	<i>Progress report</i>
2	CS2	<i>Progress report</i>
~ Coffee Break (09.45-10.00) ~		
Start of Governing Board meeting (10.00-12.45)		
3	JU	<i>Adoption of the agenda</i>
4	JU	<i>Approval of the minutes of the preceding meeting (29th June 2016)</i>
5	JU	<i>Management report (for information)</i>
6	CS2	<i>Approval of the Amended Additional Activities Plans 2014-2016 (for decision) (CS2-V)</i>
7	JU	<i>Adoption of the Amended Work Plan and Budget 2016-2017 (for decision) (JU-V)</i>
8	JU	<i>Adoption of rules on the prevention and management of conflicts of interests applicable to the bodies of the Joint Undertaking (for decision) (JU-V)</i>
9	JU	<i>Adoption of HR decisions derogations (for decision) (JU-V)</i>
10	JU	<i>Decision for establishing the Internal Audit Capability according to the Clean Sky 2 Financial Rules and for approving the IAC Audit Charter (for decision) (JU-V)</i>
Any other business & Closure of meeting		

Pre Board Technical Review

1. CS Progress report

The JU provides an update of the overall technical progress of the CS programme since the last GB meeting with particular emphasis and highlights on the remaining work for completing the demonstration activities in each ITD and the closing of the Grant Agreements.

The JU informs that the Final Reviews of Technology Evaluator and of the remaining ITDs are planned in the second half of 2016, designed to cover the overall programme, its achievements, the evaluation with



respect to the original objectives, the dissemination of foreground and the potential for innovation and exploitation.

Two reviews already performed: the Technology Evaluator (20-21 September) and Green Rotorcraft (4-6 October). The planning to the end of the year foreseen: Green Regional Aircraft 15-17 November; Smart Fixed Wing Aircraft 30 November – 2 December; Systems for Green Operations 6-8 December; Sustainable and Green Engines 12-15 December.

The JU provides an overview of the Grant Agreements for Partners, showing 102 projects remaining to be completed and closed in the first months of 2017.

The JU informs that a closing event of the CS1 Programme is planned for 22 March 2017.

The JU informs briefly the members on the draft implementation plan concerning the Memorandum of Cooperation with EASA.

2. CS2 Progress report (for info)

The JU provides an update of the key technical highlights of the CS2 programme and commends the strongly improved run rate in nearly all SPD areas. However, it is stressed that the private members' execution is still expected to be at 80 - 85%.

The JU informs that the Core Partners from Wave 2 are absorbed and the Core Partners from Wave 3 are approaching accession and kick-off with a very high success rate of accession. It announces that the CfP grant preparation has strongly improved from the CfP01.

The JU draws the attention to the following aspects and potential areas of risks of the programme:

- A further steep ramp-up of activities are planned in the quarter 4 and into 2017;
- Approach for Wind Tunnel Testing related budget and key capabilities are to be implemented;
- Significant "re-scoping" expected in some areas: to require re-evaluation of Leader content and re-consideration of CPs scope and approach;
- NGCTR critical stage of review / re-scoping;
- ECO coordination process to accelerate implementation.

The 4th call for Core Partners planning and overview of topics and total funding value is presented. The JU provides an overview of the financial status of the CPs and the so far completed participation and its respective breakdown per entity type and funding. The CfP call funding 2014-2020 and the Partners' budget absorption projection are presented, together with the so far Partners integration and breakdown per entity type and funding.

Start of Governing Board meeting

The Chairman, Ric Parker (Rolls Royce), opens the meeting, acknowledging the existent quorum and welcoming the participants. He introduces the new participating GB members: Stephane Cueille (Safran), and Ruxandra Draghi Alki (Deputy Director in DG RTD).



1. Adoption of the agenda

The Chairman asks the Board members to review the items of the agenda and to declare any conflict or potential conflict of interest in relation to the items on the agenda, which may influence, or bias the judgment and to declare any conflict, which may arise during Board discussions. The Chairman reminds that the members are requested to act in the general interest of the Joint Undertaking and to respect the confidentiality of the proceedings.

DLR, CIRA, Aernnova and NLR inform that with respect to the CPW04 topics approval they have a potential conflict of interest. The JU explains that the approval of the topics for CPW04 is not to be made today, but through the launched written procedure.

The Chairman informs that with regard to the initial agenda, the elections for the Chair and Deputy Chairperson have been postponed to the December meeting in order to align this procedure with the selection of the new Executive Director.

No objections are raised with respect to the agenda items.

Outcome: The meeting agenda is adopted.

2. Adoption of the minutes of the preceding meeting (29 June 2016)

The Chairman informs that the minutes of the 29 June 2016 meeting have been circulated to which no other comments were expressed.

Outcome: The minutes of 29 June 2016 meeting are adopted.

3. Management report (for information)

The Chairman invites the current interim Executive Director, Tiit Jürimäe, to provide a report on the operational, communication and administrative highlights. Tiit Jürimäe thanks the Board for trusting him with this position and in managing the daily operations of the JU.

On the CS Programme, the JU is working on closing the remaining active projects within the 2016 and in 2017. It is highlighted how important it is that all technical activities are closed in 2017 (the year for the final review of Clean Sky 1 and the interim review of Clean Sky 2 programmes) and have all CS1 demonstrators completed.

A closing event is foreseen on 21-22 of March (linked by the Clean Sky Forum), where the results should be widely communicated. The JU informs that the work of the SNE recruited, Raffaele Donnelli, is to support dissemination of activities.



The JU points out that it is important that the content of the final reviews and the issued recommendations are feeding the upcoming Clean Sky interim evaluation.

Concerning the budget consumption, the JU emphasises that it is essential for members not to overestimate their needs. The current budget execution is at 66% instead of 75 %.

The JU stresses that the current number of Core Partners has doubled compared with CS1, which makes the grant management process challenging in Clean Sky 2.

Careful consideration should be given in the future on the approach to be taken: defined membership at the start of programme versus open calls which delay the execution of the programme. A need to assess the advantages and disadvantages and decide better approach and optionally to prepare the calls and the topics before the programme start in order to reach a completed membership in the first year and not to drag it in the 3rd year of the programme.

The JU informs that for the 6th year in a row the Court of Auditors is proposing a clean opinion. This is a joint achievement, of which the JU can be proud.

The JU reminds the members to submit for the 2017 Work Plan and Budget by 8 November 2016 and the draft Work plan input and Budget for 2018-2019 by 15 December 2016.

The JU draws the attention that the payment of the CS1 GAPs to be executed by the end of the year is of 9 M euro (which equals the same amount that the JU has paid in the first 9 months of 2016) and the speed is not high enough. The support of the topics managers is needed in order to accelerate this process as much as possible. For CS2 Programme, 20 M euro payment appropriations are foreseen, for which the completed paperwork is needed in order to sign the GA. The PCC is working on bringing this effort at the right level.

In total 14,2 M euro are foreseen for the pre-financing of the CfP03 GAP; the target for signature initiation is 16 December 2016 and for the time to grant 30 January 2017.

Other risks highlighted by the JU refer to the CPW03 GAM accession where there is uncertainty about signature of all amendments and payment of pre-financing before year end.

The JU reminds that these execution figures will be a part of the AAR 2016, where good figures for the execution rates should be shown to the MEPs who will be assessing the overall running of the programmes.

The Chairman asserts that a lot of work must be carried out before year end and the JU is counting on everyone's support.

Regarding the HR resources, the JU informs that the Administration and Finance team is changing and with one person missing and limited secretarial staffs available at the moment, the JU needs the members' support and understanding and counts on timely delivery of good quality inputs and close cooperation in the partnership.



Regarding the Synergies, the JU provides an overview of the current state of play on the regional synergies (11 MoUs signed until date) and highlights its political importance for a stronger FP9 framework. From the strategic analysis performed, the JU recommends reaching around 30-35 regions to be fully engaged in synergies with Clean Sky and adds that as the political support becomes clearer, it is also evident that a lot of responsibilities are tied with this build-up process, and therefore, it is prudent to limit the cooperation with new regions for the moment.

The JU thanks the Commission, the EP and the private members for the support and direct involvement in establishing this process. Good progress in identifying targets and real technical synergies is being noted with Romania, Czech Republic and Poland, together with a significant number of pilot projects running. It is announced that the JU will sign another MoU with Portugal in the coming week.

The Commission welcomes the significant number of synergies created so far and asks how the added value is quantified and monitored and if actual data can be provided. The JU explains that the value generated is a combination of the leverage effect (to become more and more evident as investments increase), job creation and efficiency in spending European funds on projects with high value, but that real data is difficult to provide at this stage.

Regarding the synergies with EASA, the JU informs that the draft Memorandum of Cooperation is being finalized and ready for signature in the coming months. It adds that a list of joint activities for 2017/2018 is currently under preparation with main potential areas for cooperation in the evolution of virtual modelling and of eco-design technology developments; regulations on advanced rotorcraft configurations (compound and tilt rotor); implications in certifications and operations on small aircraft; joint workshops on additive manufacturing, rotorcraft; icing, noise etc.; Clean Sky contribution to the European Aviation Environmental Report.

Regarding Communication, the JU announces that the book, 'Innovation takes off' published by Cherche Midi and written by Gerard Maoui, tells the story of the European aviation from its beginning to today, with a focus on how the European Union's vision and policy on excellent research and innovation has led to Clean Sky (a tool to develop innovative technologies to reduce the environmental footprint of aviation). The book is ready for distribution and is being sold in bookshops and on Amazon.

The JU informs that the new website was launched with an improved structure, visual content and branding for CS and H2020. The JU asks the members to explore and come back with feedback to the Communication team.

The JU encourages the members and their CEOs to save the date and participate at the Clean Sky Forum on 21-22 March 2017 which is also the CS 1 Closing event..

The JU requests info by the end of November on what are the members planning to include as hardware at the Le Bourget Air show (end of June 2017), stating that it is a great opportunity to showcase the so far developed technologies at the CS stand, but also at the members' own stands.



Thales suggests organising an event at the Parliament to show the involvement of the CS beneficiaries and to present their achievements to the MEPs and to where interaction is ensured in panel sessions. It is agreed that this type of event should be liaised with the Sky and Space Intergroup in European parliament. The Commission welcomes this idea.

The Commission provides a brief update about the process for selecting the new Executive Director, announcing that the shortlist is now finalised and that the interviews are planned to take place in late November/beginning of December with a possible final selection at the December GB meeting, which could allow having the new Executive Director on board early next year.

The Commission informs the members on the upcoming Interim evaluation of the JTIs, planned to start in November 2016, highlighting that the full commitment of the industry and the budgetary execution are key aspects to communicate, together with the showcase of the CS achievements. The interim report is foreseen to be issued in April and the final one in June.

4. Adoption of the Amended Additional Activities Plans 2014-2016 (for decision) (CS2-V)

The JU presents for approval the Amended Additional Activities Plan for the period 2014-2016 in accordance with art. 8.2(i) of the Statutes, stating that it includes additional contributions of 53 M euro in additional activities from the existing Leaders and some new Core Partners.

The JU welcomes the additional contributions brought and urges the members to speed up the certification process as it very important to show the leverage effect.

Outcome: The Amended Additional Activities Plan for the period 2014-2016 is approved. Ref.doc.:
CS-GB-2016-10-21 Amended AAs Plans 2014-2016

5. Adoption of the Amended Work Plan and Budget 2016-2017 (for decision) (JU-V)

The JU presents for adoption the Amended Budget 2016-2017 explaining that it includes the latest updates with respect to the CS1 Programme and taking into account the most recent information from the ITDs/IADPs, the re-commitment of unused budget for the CfP03, the modification of CSJU administrative costs and CS2 operational payment appropriations in order to maximise the budget execution. The Amended Work Plan 2016-2017 introduces specific eligibility criteria for Calls for Proposals related to the Technology Evaluator, limiting the coordinator role to Non-For-Profit entities in order to ensure independence of TE assessment. It also includes minor modifications taking into account the latest developments since the last adopted version.

Outcome: The Amended Work Plan and Budget 2016-2017 is adopted. Ref.doc.:
CS-GB-2016-10-21 Decision Amended WP and Budget 2016-2017
CS-GB-2016-10-21 Amended WP and Budget 2016-2017
CS-GB-2016-10-21 Amendment nr. 3 Budget 2016-2017



6. Adoption of Rules on the prevention and management of conflicts of interests applicable to the bodies of the Joint Undertaking (for decision) (JU-V)

The JU presents for adoption the Rules on the prevention and management of conflicts of interests applicable to the bodies of the Joint Undertaking and explains that these have been proposed in order to harmonise the existing rules among the Joint Undertakings. Currently two separate decisions are drafted by the JU: one related to the bodies of the JU and the other one related to the staff. The latter is under Commission's ex-ante agreement procedure before it will be sent to the Board for adoption by written procedure.

The JU explains that the Commission comments have been integrated and transmitted to the Board members in track changes beginning of the week. An integrated change was related to the exclusion of the Executive Director from the decision related to the JU bodies, since it will be covered by the Col decision related to the staff. Other changes are related to the JU central register for the European Court of Auditors. The GB Members summary CVs may be published and Col declarations may be made available for public scrutiny based on the access to documents Regulation and after Data Protection clearance. The JU confirms no changes have been brought to the Col declarations and no additional obligations have been introduced compared to the previous Col rules.

MTU and Safran raise an objection to adopt the rules at the meeting since the companies' legal teams have not been able to analyse the last changes in such a short schedule.

The Board members agree to postpone the adoption to a fast track written procedure, to be launched by the JU after the GB meeting in order to allow more time in analysing the changes proposed..

<p>Outcome: The Rules on the prevention and management of conflicts of interests applicable to the bodies of the Joint Undertaking to be launched for adoption by written procedure.</p>

7. Adoption of HR decisions derogations (for decision) (JU-V)

The JU presents for adoption two HR decisions through which the JU requested derogation from the Commission's adopted implementing decisions of certain articles of the Staff Regulations concerning:

- TA and CA maximum duration of contracts
- Middle management staff
- Function of adviser
- Decisions on learning and development

The JU explains that since the Commission's implementing decisions did not fit with the size and the typology of the JU staff, their non-application is requested in accordance with art. 110(2) of the Staff Regulations. The GB has to agree first on this request of derogation.



The JU informs that the Standing Working Party of the EU Agencies is in the process of developing model decisions for the same areas which will be more appropriate to the size and structure of small entities, which will then have to be adopted by the GB.

Outcome: The HR decisions derogations are adopted. Ref.doc.:
CS-GB-2016-10-21 Decision on opt-out 3 EC HR decisions
CS-GB-2016-10-21 Decision on opt-out TA and CA max duration

8. Decision for establishing the Internal Audit Capability according to the Clean Sky 2 Financial Rules and for approving the IAC Audit Charter (for decision) (JU-V)

The JU presents for adoption the Decision for establishing the Internal Audit Capability (IAC) in accordance with art. 8.2(i) of the Statutes and art. 28 of the Financial Rules, together with the Mission charter of the IAC. The JU explains that two options were considered for cost efficiency considerations: to establish one individual IAC per JU or share IAC between several JUs. The JU management sees an added value in internal advice and audit function. At present, the scope of the post comprises in addition quality management and, as such requires a full time position. None of the other JUs is at present interested to establish a shared IAC function.

The decision of the GB confirms the current status quo of the 2 Internal Audit functions in the JU (Internal Audit Service of the Commission plus the IAC). It is proposed to maintain the individual IAC for CSJU and to establish it under the new Financial Rules.

The Chairman thanks Bettina Dittmann for her work and integrity show so far in her role as IAC.

Outcome: The Decision for establishing the Internal Audit Capability according to the Clean Sky 2 Financial Rules and for approving the IAC Audit Charter is adopted. Ref.doc.:
CS-GB-2016-10-21 Decision IA capability
CS-GB-2016-10-21 IAC_charter

Any other business

The Chairman thanks Elizabeth Gavin who is leaving her role as Head of Administration and Finance and congratulates her for the excellent work and dedication shown the past 6 years of career in the JU.

The JU asks the Board members to save the date of the first GB of 2017, scheduled for 23 of March.

The Chairman thanks everyone for participating and closes the meeting.

~End of Minutes~